Appendix IX

Comments on EIA Report from the Advisory Council on the Environment

EIA Report Title	ACE Comments
Pak Shek Kok Development	Endorsement with conditions : ● The condition of the marine mud and the impact on the dredging and disposal of the mud should be kept within established guidelines; ● All mitigation measures in the report should be implemented.
Tsuen Wan Bay Further Reclamation , Area 35, Tsuen Wan - Engineering, Planning and Environmental Investigation	Endorsement with condition : ● The proponent undertake to conduct further site investigation and testing during the detailed design stage.
Kai Tak Airport North Apron Decommissioning	Endorsement with conditions : ● The project proponent should submit to the EIA Subcommittee a report on the results of the pilot test on the effectiveness of the "Soil Vapour Extraction" and "Air Sparging" methods before starting the decontamination work using the afore-said methods; and ● The project proponent should submit to the EIA Subcommittee a report on final soil quality of the contaminated areas upon the completion of the remediation process before starting the proposed housing development.
Yuen Long Bypass Floodway - Feasibility Study	Endorsement without conditions
Planning and Engineering Feasibility Study for Development at Anderson Road	Endorsement with condition : ● The proponent will implement the recommendation contained in the report to plant 13.4 ha of woodland on soft cut slopes using native species. A proposal including details of the species mix, future long-term maintenance, and timetable for implementation will be prepared to the satisfaction of the Director of Agriculture and Fisheries
EIA for Dredging an Area of Kellett Bank for Reprovisioning of Six Government Mooring Buoys	Endorsement without conditions
Footbridge and Improvements to Ap Lei Chau Bridge Road and Ap Lei Chau Drive *	No comment from ACE during public inspection period.
Planning and Engineering Feasibility Study for Development near Choi Wan Road and Jordan Valley	Endorsement with condition : ● A review on the Landfill Gas hazard assessment including an additional investigation, particularly on the fault lines, and rigorous monitoring programme should be undertaken by the project proponent; and the EIA Subcommittee should be consulted on the proposed mitigation measures if problems were identified during the investigation
1,800 MW Gas-fired Power Station in Lamma Extension	Endorsement with condition : ● The power station extension will be fuelled by liquid natural gas instead of coal.
Infrastructure Works for the Proposed Development at Telegraph Bay	Endorsement without conditions
Tang Lung Chau Dangerous Goods Anchorage - EIA	Endorsement without conditions

Main Drainage Channels and Poldered Village Protection Scheme for San Tin, NWNT	Endorsement with condition : ● The project proponent would liaise and negotiate with the Architectural Services Department on the integration of mitigating wetland as well as to minimize the disturbance to the wetland by limiting the use of the side-ways leading to the access road.
Planning and Development Study of Potential Housing Site in Area 54, Tuen Mun	Endorsement without conditions
EIA for Salisbury Road Underpass and Associated Road Improvement Works including Middle Road Circulation System	Endorsement without conditions
Essential Public Infrastructure with Works Associated with West Rail Stations in Yuen Long, Tin Shui Wai and Tuen Mun Centre	Endorsement without conditions
Feasibility Study on Alternative Alignment for the Western Coast Road, Tseung Kwan O*	No comment from ACE during public inspection period.
Tseung Kwan O Development, Contract F, Grade Separated Interchange T1/P1/P2 *	No comment from ACE during public inspection period.
Route 9 between Tsing Yi and Cheung Sha Wan	Endorsement without conditions.
Sai Sha Road Widening between Kam Yin Road and Proposed Road T7 Junction	Endorsement without conditions.
Widening and Reconstruction of Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section) *	No comment from ACE during public inspection period
Sha Tin Sewage Treatment Works Stage III Extension	Endorsement without conditions
Route 16 Investigation Assignment - Alternative Alignment Study	Endorsement without conditions
132kV Overhead Po Lam Line and Underground Cable from the Existing Po Lam Substation to the existing Tui Min Hoi Substation - Circuit No. 2 *	No comment from ACE during public inspection period
Hebe Haven Yach Club Development - Phase 2 *	No comment from ACE during public inspection period
Essential Public Infrastructure Works - Yuen Long, Tin Shui Wai, Tuen Mun Centre and the Eastern Access Road	Endorsement without conditions

KCRC - Tai Wai to Ma On Shan Extension	Endorsement with conditions ● The noise impact would not be worse than the predictions made in the report; ● The proponent and its contractors would submit to the Subcommittee detailed proposals on ways to further minimize the construction noise impact as far as practicable before commencing works at sections with possible noise exceedances; and ● The proponent to devise an enhanced environmental monitoring and audit programme on the sites predicted to be affected by possible construction noise exceedances.
Light Rail Transit (LRT) Extension in Tin Shui Wai Reserve Zone and Grade Separation of the LRT with Pui To Road and Tsing Lun Road in Tuen Mun	Endorsement without conditions
Tin Shui Wai Phase 4 Rail Extension	Endorsement without conditions
New World First Bus Permanent Depot at Chai Wan*	No comment from ACE during public inspection period
Route 10 - North Lantau to Yuen Long Highway Investigation and Preliminary Design (Southern Section)	Endorsement with conditions : ● Construction of the Southern section of Route 10 would not commence until the EIA report of the Northern section was completed and endorsed. ● When the EIA report for the Northern section is submitted under the EIA Ordinance, the cumulative environmental impact of both the Southern and Northern sections of Route 10 and all relevant findings and recommendations in both EIA studies could be subject to review. ● The findings of the design review study of the toll plaza would be submitted to the Subcommittee once finalized.
KCRC - East Rail Extension - Hung Hom to Tsim Sha Tsui	Endorsement with conditions : ● Set up a continuous noise monitoring mechanism at locations to be decided in consultation with the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP); ● Make available to the public the results of the continuous noise monitoring mechanism through the proponent's website; ● Activate remedial measures in the event that the noise levels exceed the worst case scenario predicted in the EIA report; ● Carry out a monitoring programme on the result of transplanting works; and ● Provide a total of 1,500 trees upon completion of the project.
Tuen Mun Sewerage - Eastern Coastal Sewerage Extension	Endorsement with condition : ● This EIA report was endorsed on the condition that the project proponent would submit the method statement to the Director of Environmental Protection for endorsement before the commencement of the works along narrow alleys.

Shenzhen River Regulation Project Stage III	Endorsement with conditions : ● A 2-year monitoring exercise would be conducted for the operation stage of the project on its impact on the sedimentation rate and particle size at the mouth of Shenzhen River; ● A study on the 'Dismantle of Lo Wu Railway Bridge' would be conducted within at least 6 months before commencement of the project, which should include detailed rules on information recording and dismantle procedures, dismantle programme, guidelines for preserving the dismantled materials, location of re-erection, restoration programme and detailed rules for restoration. The Bridge should only be demolished after the dismantle proposal is approved by the Hong Kong Antiquities and Monuments Office and other relevant authorities; ● Benthic monitoring would be conducted at the river mouth during construction and operational phases of the project until such time that the Ramsar monitoring is formally started to take over the benthic monitoring; and ● The scale of soil filling in Nam Hang Middle Valley as indicated in the EIA report would be reduced by at least 100,000m3.
Northshore Lantau Development Feasibility Study	Endorsement with conditions : ● Design and construct the relevant section of Chok Ko Wan Link Road between Route 10 toll plaza and Pai Tau Kwu on embankment and with the existing coastline preserved, subject to the water quality issue being resolved to the satisfaction of DEP and ACE being further consulted on the final design; and ● Design and build the proposed walking trails at least 50 metres away from Mong Tung Hang Stream

Construction of an International Theme Park in Penny's Bay of North Lantau and its Essential Associated Infrastructures	Endorsement with conditions : ● Not commence any works on the site of the Cheoy Lee Shipyard until a separate EIA for its decommissioning is completed and an environmental permit issued by DEP; ● Carry out trail tests of firework displays at Penny's Bay site prior to the opening of the International Theme Park and provide the results of the trials tests and associated air quality data to ACE for consultation; ● After opening of the International Theme Park, monitor air pollutants arising from the firework displays and on the basis of such findings, work out appropriate remedial measures, if needed, to the satisfaction of DEP; ● Monitor the occurrence of TBT, PAHs and PCB in the waters of Penny's Bay before and during the initial phase of dredging operations; ● Carry out a three-year monitoring programme of the post-transplanting by experienced botanist and a ten-year maintenance programme of the woodland compensatory planting; ● Undertake a three-year monitoring programme of the effectiveness of the sloping seawall as an ecological mitigation measure. If recolonization of the corals occurs at a slow rate, the proponent should continue the monitoring for another three years. If re-colonization does not occur, the proponent should consider further mitigation measures in conjunction with the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD); ● Deploy at least 4,350m^3 of artificial reefs at site(s) to be decided by AFCD and work out effective management arrangement in conjunction with AFCD; and ● Implement appropriate measures to protect the pair of White-bellied Sea Eagles; in the event of their abandoning the existing nest, take all reasonable and practical measures to protect the new nesting site. To carry out monitoring of the White-bellied Sea Eagles throughout the construction phase and during the first two years of the operational phase of the International Theme Park.
Tai O Sheltered Boat Anchorage	Endorsement without condition.
Widening of Tolo Highway/Fanling Highway between Island House Interchange and Fanling	Endorsement with condition : ● This EIA report was also endorsed without condition. Members of the Council were given the understanding that the section of the Fanling Highway to the north of Wo Hop Shek Interchange would not be widened in the foreseeable future.

Sheung Shui to Lok Ma Chau	Endorsement with conditions : ● Certain parts of the EIA report particularly that relating to ecological baseline information need to be strengthened and updated; for example, there has been no field survey on reptiles, amphibians, and mammals and little information on the Black-faced Spoonbill which is found in the Lok Ma Chau area. The availability of such additional information may have bearing on the selection of design and alignment, and may even necessitate revision of the mitigation measures proposed which should be target and species specific. ● The proponent acknowledged in their final submission to ACE that the proposed central alignment had greater ecological impact on Long Valley than any of the other considered options. There is much concern that such alignment would bring serious ecological impacts and significant habitat fragmentation to Long Valley. Some members feel that cutting into the centre of Long Valley is not acceptable. They are not fully convinced that the project proponent has exhausted all possible alignment options and that the constraints (e.g. the problem with the Shek Wu Sewage Treatment Works) mentioned in the alternative alignments explored are indeed insurmountable. To minimise the impact on Long Valley, they would prefer an alignment either running close to River Beas or to the north of the River. ● Some members are concerned about the lack of information on benchmark functional value, both for the meanders and for the existing Lok Ma Chau fishponds which are proposed for compensation. In the case of the meanders, the mitigation proposed to be carried out by Territory Development Department has not yet been implemented; there is therefore no way to measure the benchmark value there. Given the lack of information on the benchmark ecological value, some members therefore prefer ecological compensation on a " like-for-like" basis on terms of area. ● Some members are not satisfied that the proponent has produced sufficient evidence to demonstrate that the proposed mitigation measures will work and can attain with certainty the stated ecological functionality, noting in particular information available overseas that the failure rate of re-created wetland has been as high as 50% to 73%. In view of this high failure rate overseas and the lack of comparable experience in Hong Kong, the proposed mitigation measures, which allow for an error margin of only 20% are considered insufficient. The project proponent has also failed to provide adequate contingency or fallback plans in the event of failure.

Cyberport Development & associated Engineering Infrastructure	Endorsement without conditions.
West Kowloon Reclamation Contract No. WK 30- Remaining Roadworks Stage 4, Links Road G & L*	No comment from ACE during public inspection period.
Modification to MTRC Tsim Sha Tsui Station	Endorsement without conditions.
Improvement to Castle Peaks Road between Ka Loon Tsuen and Siu Lam*	No comment from ACE during public inspection period.
Central Reclamation Phase III	Endorsement with condition : ● The EM&A programme of the project should be uploaded on the Internet for public information.
Lei Yue Mun Road Underpass Modification at Junction with Yau Tong Road and Associated Improvement Works - Feasibility Study*	No comment from ACE during public inspection period.
Central - Wan Chai Bypass and Island Eastern Corridor Link	Endorsement with condition : ● The EM&A programme of the project should be uploaded on the Internet for public information.
Wan Chai Development Phase II	Endorsement with conditions : ● **Trial tests on the use of geosynthetic containers and related handling mechanism** should be undertaken under the scrutiny of EPD and a report should be made to the Council before implementation; and ● The EM&A programme of the project should be uploaded on the Internet for public information.
Comprehensive Feasibility Study for the Revised Scheme of South East Kowloon Development	Endorsement without conditions but suggested relocation of the planned schools away from trunk roads as far as possible.
Proposed Headquarters and Bus Maintenance Depot in Chai Wan	Endorsement with condition : ● The monitoring on construction noise should be increased from a weekly basis to once every three days.
Tseung Kwan O Roads D1,D8 And D10*	No comment from ACE during public inspection period.
Demolition of Kwai Chung Incineration Plant	Endorsement without conditions.
Replacement of Cremators at Fu Shan Crematorium, Shatin*	No comment from ACE during public inspection period.
** The EIA report for the project was not selected for its presentation to the council*	