

STRATEGIES FOR MITIGATION MEASURES

The following and **Table 1** summarise the evaluation of a number of the possible strategies for mitigation of impacts on the 3 historical buildings and their associated pros and cons. These include (I) in-situ preservation, (II) documentation prior to dismantling, temporary storage and reassemble within DHS area, (III) permanent relocation off-site, and (IV) documentation and demolition.

Alternative locations for stabling siding had been thoroughly investigated (see **Section 4.7.1.1** and **Appendix 4.4B**) and is not technically feasible. Alternative designs of DHS to avoid direct impact on the historical buildings have also been considered and was not pursued on the ground of significant programme and cost impacts to the SCL project (see **Section 4.7.1.1** and **Appendix 4.4B**). Therefore, in-situ preservation as mitigation measure for the 3 historical buildings is not feasible for the implementation of the SCL project.

Permanent relocation of the 3 historical buildings off the DHS site would lead to a loss of historical linkages of the place (Former Tai Hom Village) with such as the old Kai Tak airport and World War II. This option is also not recommended.

Documentation and demolition (IV) is not recommended as mitigation measures neither as it completely neglects the cultural value of these structures to the local community.

Documentation prior to dismantling, temporary storage and reassemble the 3 historical buildings within DHS site is the recommended mitigation measures. Though disassembling and temporary relocation of the historical buildings would lead to loss of heritage value, placing them back within DHS site would respect the public aspirations of these 3 historical buildings.

Table 1 : Strategies for Mitigation Measures Considered

Option	Former Royal Airforce Hangar	Stone House, No. 4 Tai Koon Yuen	Old Pillbox	Evaluation
(I)	<u>In-situ Preservation</u> Avoidance of any direct impact on the Hangar by selecting: a) alternative locations for the stabling sidings b) alternative design or construction method of the stabling siding.	<u>In-situ Preservation</u> Avoidance of any direct impact on the Stone House by selecting: a) alternative locations for the stabling sidings b) alternative design or construction method of the stabling siding	<u>In-site Preservation</u> Avoidance of any direct impact on the Old Pillbox by selecting: a) alternative locations for the stabling sidings b) alternative design or construction method of the stabling siding	<u>Pros</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Direct impact on the historical buildings would be avoided <u>Cons</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Implementation of the SCL project would be affected as the Diamond Hill CDA site is the only feasible location for the stabling siding after extensive evaluation of alternative locations Construction of the stabling siding underground would delay the SCL program by approximately 9 – 12 months

Option	Former Royal Airforce Hangar	Stone House, No. 4 Tai Koon Yuen	Old Pillbox	Evaluation
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Due to physical constrains, current design of the DHS could not avoid the Hangar and the Stone House within the DHS area or otherwise the DHS would not be functional. It would only avoid direct impact on the Old Pillbox • However, the separation distance between the construction and the Old Pillbox may not be sufficient to mitigate the adverse indirect impact from construction • Retrofitting of the Hangar would be required to conserve the structure as some of the steel members have deteriorated beyond repair due to lack of regular maintenance according to the condition survey report (Appendix 4.4B)
(II)	<p><u>Documentation prior to dismantling, temporary storage and Reassemble within the DHS site</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Detailed photographic and cartographic recorded of the Hangar prior to dismantling 2. Dismantle the Hangar with care 3. Record and securely transport and store each component 4. Reassemble the Hangar within the DHS site using building/construction components of the original 	<p><u>Documentation prior to dismantling, temporary storage and Reassemble within the DHS site</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Detailed photographic and cartographic recorded of the Stone House prior to dismantling 2. Dismantle the Stone House with care 3. Record and securely transport and store each component 4. Reassemble the Stone House within the DHS site using building/ construction components of the original 	<p><u>Documentation prior to dismantling, (or relocation by lifting it up in one piece subject to further engineering study) temporary storage and Reassemble within the DHS site</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Detailed photographic and cartographic recorded of the Pillbox prior to dismantling 2. Dismantle the Pillbox with care (or relocation by lifting it up in one piece subject to further engineering study) 3. Record and securely transport and store each 	<p><u>Pros</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The historical linkage of the place (Former Tai Hom Village) and its association with the old Kai Tak airport and World War II history would still be retained for the local community by reassembling the 3 historical buildings within the DHS site <p><u>Cons</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Disassembling and temporary relocation of the historical buildings would lead to loss of heritage value

Option	Former Royal Airforce Hangar	Stone House, No. 4 Tai Koon Yuen	Old Pillbox	Evaluation
	structure (retrofitting would be required to reassemble the Hangar as a structurally sound building)	structure (retrofitting would be required to reassemble the Stone House as a structurally sound building)	component 4. Reassemble the Pillbox within the DHS site using building/construction components of the original structure	
(III) See Note 1	<u>Permanent relocation</u> - To a neighbouring designated area that is related to aircraft operation / history or military etc (see Note 2)	<u>Permanent relocation</u> - To a neighbouring designated area that is related to film industry (see Note 3).	<u>Permanent relocation</u> - To a neighbouring designated area that is related to aircraft operation / history or military etc (see Note 2)	<u>Pros</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Easy public access • More synergy with the other facilities in the designated areas and offer opportunities to integrate with neighbouring built heritage • Insignificant impact on DHS planning and operation, and top-side development <u>Cons</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The historical and cultural value would be reduced by relocating them off the DHS site. • The historical linkage of the place (Former Tai Hom Village) such as its associated links with the old Kai Tak airport and World War II history would be lost when the 3 historical buildings is relocated off the DHS site.
(V)	<u>Documentation and demolition</u> - Including cartographic and photographic record and demolition/ preservation in part	<u>Documentation and demolition</u> - Including cartographic and photographic record and demolition/ preservation in part	<u>Documentation and demolition</u> - Including cartographic and photographic record and demolition/ preservation in part	<u>Pros</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Insignificant impact on DHS planning and operation, and top-side development <u>Cons</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural value of the structures to the local community is neglected.

Note 1 : The most relevant built heritages in the vicinity are the complex of ex- RAF buildings in Kowloon Bay. These historical buildings include:

<u>Building</u>	<u>Current Use</u>	<u>AMO Grading</u>		<u>Ownership</u>
		<u>Current</u>	<u>Proposed</u>	
(1) Ex-Royal Air Force Station (Kai Tak), Officers' Quarters Compound, RAF Officers Mess	Used as the Police Detective Training School in the 80s' and currently as HK Baptist University Campus 浸大啓德校園	1	2	Govt
(2) Ex-Royal Air Force Station (Kai Tak), Headquarters Building	Caritas Family Crisis Support Centre 明愛向晴軒	1	2	Govt
(3) Ex-Royal Air Force Station (Kai Tak), Officers' Quarters Compound, Annex Block No 2	Used as the Police Detective Training School in the 80s' and currently as HK Baptist University Campus 浸大啓德校園	1	2	Govt

All the above buildings have direct historical link to the military history of HK, especially for the 2nd World War. It is therefore a possible location from cultural linkage perspective for relocating the 3 relics.

A brief history of the ex-RAF building complex in Kowloon Bay is summarised below :

- The British RAF first started its operation in HK in 1924 and established its airforce base in 1927. In 1934, the British RAF spent 5 million pounds to upgrade the airforce headquarters and its associated complex at the current location. During the 2nd World War in 1941, the headquarters building was attacked by the Japanese troops. During the Japanese occupation, it was used by the Japanese army for their uses.
- After the 2nd World War, the buildings were occupied by the British RAF again until the RAF was relocated to Stonecutter Island in 1981. During the 80's and 90's, the buildings were once used for managing the Vietnam refugees. It is currently used by Caritas Family Crisis Support Centre, HK Baptist University and other NGO.

Note 2 : Possible off-site designated areas for preserving the 3 treasures include the following :

- HK Aviation Club
- Shek Kong Airport
- Hong Kong International Airport
- Ocean Park

- Walt Disney Co (Asia Pacific) Ltd
- Shaw Brothers (Hong Kong) Ltd
- TVB City

It is however none of the above would above to take over the structures. A summary of Correspondences for off-site designated areas for the 3 Heritage Structures are as follows:

Proposed Off-site Designed Area	Letter sent	Response
HK Aviation Club	11-Feb-09	Verbal reply not interested
Shek Kong Airport	11-Feb-09	Nil
Hong Kong International Airport	11-Feb-09	Not interested via letter dated 2 March 09
Ocean Park	9-Feb-09	Beyond their scope via email dated 16 Feb 09
Walt Disney Co. Asai Pacific	12-Feb-09	Verbal reply not interested
Shaw Brothers (HK) Ltd	9-Feb-09	Nil
TVB City	9-Feb-09	Nil