

Appendix 5.18

Letter from Education Bureau

Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture

Summary Discussion Notes

Project title	Agreement No. CE 43/2010 (HY) Central Kowloon Route – Design and Construction	Job number 217722
Meeting name and number	Discussion on Noise Mitigation Measures on Planned Schools at Yau Ma Tei and Kai Tak Development (KTD)	File reference
Location	Room 615B, Homantin Government Office	Time and date 9:30am 15 June 2012
Purpose of meeting	The purpose is to discuss the proposed noise mitigation measures on planned schools at Yau Ma Tei and Kai Tak Development (KTD)	
Present	Mr. Roy Lam Ms. Celia Lo Ms. Connie Tam Mr. Colin Keung Mr. John Lam Mr. C L Wong Mr. Franki Chiu Mr. Ken Chan Mr. Wai-Kwan Chiu	HyD/MW HyD/MW EDB EPD EPD Arch SD Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture (AMMJV) Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture (AMMJV) Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture (AMMJV)
Apologies		
Circulation	Those present Mr. Stephen Chan Miss Glenda Bow	PlanD EDB

Noise Impact

General

- AMMJV presented the latest CKR alignment with elevated/ at-grade road at west of Hoi Wang Road (West Portion) and Kai Tak Interchange and tunnel section between Yau Ma Tei and Kai Tak Development. The target completion year is late 2020 and hence the worst case traffic flow within 15 years would be 2036. Year 2036 will therefore be adopted for assessment year.
- AMMJV presented the noise standards for road traffic noise, i.e. $L_{10(1\text{hour})}$ 65 dB(A) for educational institution. Moreover, if overall noise levels at receivers exceed the noise criteria, noise mitigation measures are required such that the noise level from Project Road does not exceed the noise criteria and the noise contribution from Project Road is lesser than 1.0 dB(A).

Kai Tak Development (East Portion)

- The planned secondary school is located in Site 3B1 according to the RODP dated May 2011. Since there was no confirmed layout of the school, a typical school layout was assumed for assessment purpose. The building height is 45mPD according to the height restriction shown on the OZP.
- AMMJV presented the traffic flow and traffic speed for Year 2036 (PM) at East Portion. Low Noise Road Surfacing (LNRS) was applied in the road with design speed greater than 70 km/hr including CKR main road and re-aligned Kai Fuk Road as unmitigated scenario.

Summary Discussion Notes

Project title	Job number	Date of Meeting
Agreement No. CE 43/2010 (HY) Central Kowloon Route – <u>Design and Construction</u>	217722	15 June 2012

- The concerned Site 3B1 was zoned as Undesignated in the KTD EIA. The noise mitigation measure in KTD EIA recommended that the layout of the affected NSRs could be designed to avoid the noise sensitive uses facing the major traffic noise sources or providing the noise sensitive uses, like hotel with window insulation and air conditioning.
- A comparison of traffic flow between KTD EIA (Year 2031 AM) and CKR EIA (Year 2036 PM) was presented and similar traffic flow of CKR main road was observed (4760 veh/hr vs 4989 veh/hr).
- Six scenarios were considered for road traffic noise assessment at the planned school:
 - Unmitigated Scenario (LNRS with project road design speed greater than 70 km/hr)
 - Case 1 – Mitigated scenario (LNRS with project road design speed greater than 50 km/hr)
 - Case 2 – Mitigated scenario (LNRS with project road design speed greater than 50 km/hr plus 5m vertical noise barrier on CKR main roads and S4)
 - Case 3 – Mitigated scenario (LNRS with project road design speed greater than 50 km/hr plus 5m +3m cantilevered noise barrier on CKR main roads and S4)
 - Case 4 – Mitigated scenario (LNRS with project road design speed greater than 50 km/hr plus semi-enclosure on CKR main roads and S4)
 - Case 5 – Mitigated scenario (LNRS with project road design speed greater than 70 km/hr and avoid noise sensitive façade facing directly to CKR)
- Noise exceedance over the criterion of 65dB(A) was predicted at the planned school for all the scenarios above. The noise contribution from Project Roads was greater than 1.0 dB(A).
- As noise barrier in Kai Tak Area was not supported by CEDD/KDO, noise mitigation measures in form of LNRS on CKR main roads and Kai Fuk Road with design speed greater than 70 km/hr and the sensitive façade of the planned school avoiding facing the CKR were recommended.
- ArchSD advised that there was no implementation programme for the planned school in Site 3B-1 and also understood that noise exceedance over the criterion of 65dB(A) was predicted at the planned school with the proposed mitigation measures (Case 1 to Case 4).
- EDB and ArchSD agreed that Case 5 would be the recommended noise mitigation measure for presenting in the CKR EIA.

Yau Ma Tei (West Portion)

- The planned school was located west of Ferry Street and opposite to Prosperous Garden. Since there was no confirmed layout of the school, a typical school layout was assumed for assessment purpose. There was no height restriction according to the current OZP. The number of floors of the planned school was assumed to be eight floors which was same as the schools nearby.
- AMMJV presented the traffic flow and traffic speed for Year 2036 (PM) at West Portion. The total traffic flow of CKR main road (southbound and north bound) is over 8000 veh/hr.
- Four scenarios were considered for road traffic noise assessment at the planned school:
 - Unmitigated Scenario (LNRS with project road design speed greater than 70 km/hr)
 - Case 1 – Mitigated scenario (LNRS with project road design speed greater than 70 km/hr and recommended noise mitigation measures in West Portion including full enclosure at west portal end, two 3m vertical noise barrier at Lai Cheung Road, semi-enclosure at Hoi Hang Road and full enclosure at Ferry Street Flyover etc)
 - Case 2 – Mitigated scenario (same as Case 1 but with modification of two 3m vertical noise barriers at Lai Cheung Road to two 5m vertical noise barriers)
 - Case 3 – Mitigated scenario (same as Case 1 but with modification of two 3m vertical noise barriers at Lai Cheung Road to two semi-enclosures)
- Noise exceedance over the criterion of 65dB(A) was predicted at the planned school (W-P7C) for all the scenarios above due to the gap between the two noise barriers for the entry of Hau Cheung Street.

Summary Discussion Notes

Project title	Job number	Date of Meeting
Agreement No. CE 43/2010 (HY) Central Kowloon Route – <u>Design and Construction</u>	217722	15 June 2012

- Hence, AMMJV suggested that the noise sensitive façade (W-P7C) of the planned school to avoid facing the CKR Project Road.
- HyD advised that no comments on the proposed noise mitigation measures from EDB (School Building Team) was received.
- AMMJV recommended that building layout block could be assumed for assessment which was same as East Portion and the future developer could be allowed to consider the assumed layout. These recommendations should be included in the CKR EIA.

Summary of Key Action Items

Key Tasks

Action

Noise

- Prepare the meeting minutes of discussion on the confirmation of noise mitigation measures on planned school for circulation and agreement. AMMJV

Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture

Your ref
Our ref 217722/6.20/EC/HL/FC/CWK/RH/0440

BY HAND

Level 5 Festival Walk
80 Tat Chee Avenue
Kowloon Tong
Kowloon
Hong Kong

Distribution List

t +852 2528 3031
d +852 2268 3548
f +852 2268 3954

eric.chan@arup.com
www.arup.com

21 May 2012

Dear Sir/ Madam

**Agreement No. CE 43/2010 (HY)
Central Kowloon Route - Design and Construction
Environmental Impact Assessment
Second Round of Response to Comments for Confirmation on the Noise Mitigation
Measures on Planned Schools**

We refer to our previous letter reference 217722/6.20/EC/DL/HL/FC/LY/CC-0306 dated 29 February 2012 on the captioned project and subsequent email dated 10 April 2012 containing the first round of response to comments. We have received the second round of comments and we would like to provide second round of response to comments for the concerned parties. The first round of response to comments is also attached for reference.

Nevertheless, we would like to have a discussion meeting after receiving all comments from concerned parties. The schedule of meeting will be sent through email.

We would be grateful if you could respond by 28 May 2012. A nil return is required. Please contact our Mr. W K Chiu at 2268 3149 or the undersigned for details if required. Thank you for your help in advance.

Yours faithfully
For and on behalf of
Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture



Eric Chan
Project Manager

Encl

cc. CE2/MW, HyD – Mr Michael C L Leung (w/e)

Distribution List

Name	Address
<p>Ms. TAM Choi Chun, Connie Proj Mgr (SIP)2 (Tel: 3509 8423)</p>	<p>Education Bureau Planning, Infrastructure and School Places Allocation Branch Infrastructure & Research Support Division School Building Section School Improvement Programme Team 6/F, East Wing, Central Government Offices 2 Tim Mei Avenue, Tamar, Hong Kong</p>
<p>Mr. LAI Wai Lok, Ricky Ch Proj Offr(SB)22 (Tel: 3509 8426)</p>	<p>Education Bureau Planning, Infrastructure and School Places Allocation Branch Infrastructure & Research Support Division School Building Section School Building Team 6/F, East Wing, Central Government Offices 2 Tim Mei Avenue, Tamar, Hong Kong</p>
<p>Mr. CHAN Chung Yun, Stephen Sr Town Plnr/Kln 3 (Tel: 2231 4868)</p>	<p>Planning Department District Planning Branch Metro District Planning Division Kowloon District Planning Office 14/F, North Point Government Offices 333 Java Road Hong Kong</p>
<p>Mr. SOH Chun Kwok Sr Town Plnr/Yau Tsim Mong (Tel: 2158 6358)</p>	<p>Planning Department District Planning Branch Metro District Planning Division Tsuen Wan and West Kowloon District Planning Office 14/F, Sha Tin Government Offices 1 Sheung Wo Che Road Sha Tin, N.T.</p>
<p>Ms. CHANG Yuen Ni, Yvonne Sr Estate Surveyor/Kowloon South (District Lands Office, Kowloon West) (Tel: 2332 2226)</p>	<p>Lands Department Lands Administration Office District Lands Office, Kowloon West 10th floor, Yau Ma Tei Carpark Building 250 Shanghai Street Kowloon</p>
<p>Ms. KWAN Yuen Ling, Elaine Estate Surveyor/Kai Tak Airport (District Lands Office, Kowloon East) (Tel: 2300 1718)</p>	<p>Lands Department Lands Administration Office District Lands Office, Kowloon East 10th floor, Yau Ma Tei Carpark Building 250 Shanghai Street Kowloon</p>

Name	Address
Mr. LEUNG Wing Yuen, Walter Sr Engr / Dist Monitoring Group on Housing Sites & SD (Kln) (Tel: 2301 1453)	Civil Engineering and Development Department Kowloon Development Office Kai Tak Office Kowloon Division 2 7th Floor, Empire Centre 68 Mody Road, Tsim Sha Tsui Kowloon
Mr. WONG Lop Fai Ch Project Manager 303 (Tel: 2867 3369)	Architectural Services Department Project Management Branch 3 Division 303 36/F, High Block, Queensway Government Offices, 66 Queensway, Hong Kong
Mr. WONG Chi Leung Sr Project Manager 125 (Tel: 2716 8522)	Architectural Services Department Project Management Branch 1 Division 102 19/F, 410 Kwun Tong Road
Mr. CHAN Ho Ming, Leo Sr Engr/Strategic Roads 3 (Tel: 3150 8209)	Transport Department Planning Branch Strategic Roads Division Section 3 & Section 4 Room 2401 - 2405, 24/F, China Resources Building, 26 Harbour Road, Wanchai, Hong Kong

Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture

Curref 217722/6.20/EC/DL/HL/FC/LT/CC-0306

BY HAND

Distribution List

15 February 2012

Level 5 Festival Walk
80 Tat Chee Avenue
Kowloon Tong
Kowloon
Hong Kong
t +852 2528 3031
d +852 2268 3548
f +852 2268 3954
eric.chan@arup.com
www.arup.com

Dear Sirs & Madam

**Agreement No. CE 43/2010 (HY)
Central Kowloon Route - Design and Construction
Environmental Impact Assessment
Confirmation on the Noise Mitigation Measures on Planned Schools**

We (AMMJV - Joint Venture of Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Ltd (Arup) and Mott MacDonald Hong Kong Ltd (MM)) have been appointed by HyD for the Consultancy Agreement No. CE 43/2010 (HY) Central Kowloon Route - Design & Construction.

We have prepared an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Report under the EIA Study Brief ESB-156/2006 issued by EPD. There are two planned schools in East Portion (Site 3B1, NSR ID. E-P14) and West Portion (NSR ID W-P7C). We have considered different forms of noise mitigation measures such as low noise road surfacing and noise barrier to mitigate the road traffic noise. However, there still have noise exceedances of road traffic noise criteria. With reference to the Kai Tak Development EIA, the planned development (Site 3B1) could be designed to avoid the noise sensitive uses facing the major traffic noise sources. Hence, in our EIA study, we also recommended the planned schools in East Portion (Site 3B1, NSR ID. E-P14) and West Portion (NSR ID W-P7C) should avoid the noise sensitive uses facing the major traffic noise sources. Please find the enclosure drawings showing the noise mitigation measures recommended. We would be grateful if you could provide us comments for our proposed noise mitigation measures on the planned schools in East Portion and West Portion.

We would be grateful if you could respond by 29 February 2012. Please contact our Ms Lindy Tam at 3447 6087 or the undersigned for details if required. Thank you for your help in advance.

Yours faithfully
For and on behalf of
Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture



Eric Chan
Project Manager

Encl.

cc HyD/MW - Mr. Michael Leung, CE2/CKR

Distribution List

Name	Address
<p>Ms. TAM Choi Chun, Connie Proj Mgr (SIP)2 (Tel: 3509 8423)</p>	<p>Education Bureau Planning, Infrastructure and School Places Allocation Branch Infrastructure & Research Support Division School Building Section School Improvement Programme Team 6/F, East Wing, Central Government Offices 2 Tim Mei Avenue, Tamar, Hong Kong</p>
<p>Mr. LAI Wai Lok, Ricky Ch Proj Offr(SB)22 (Tel: 3509 8426)</p>	<p>Education Bureau Planning, Infrastructure and School Places Allocation Branch Infrastructure & Research Support Division School Building Section School Building Team 6/F, East Wing, Central Government Offices 2 Tim Mei Avenue, Tamar, Hong Kong</p>
<p>Mr. CHAN Chung Yun, Stephen Sr Town Plnr/Kln 3 (Tel: 2231 4868)</p>	<p>Planning Department District Planning Branch Metro District Planning Division Kowloon District Planning Office 14/F, North Point Government Offices 333 Java Road Hong Kong</p>
<p>Mr. SOH Chun Kwok Sr Town Plnr/Yau Tsim Mong (Tel: 2158 6358)</p>	<p>Planning Department District Planning Branch Metro District Planning Division Tsuen Wan and West Kowloon District Planning Office 14/F, Sha Tin Government Offices 1 Sheung Wo Che Road Sha Tin, N.T.</p>
<p>Ms. CHANG Yuen Ni, Yvonne Sr Estate Surveyor/Kowloon South (District Lands Office, Kowloon West) (Tel: 2332 2226)</p>	<p>Lands Department Lands Administration Office District Lands Office, Kowloon West 10th floor, Yau Ma Tei Carpark Building 250 Shanghai Street Kowloon</p>
<p>Ms. KWAN Yuen Ling, Elaine Estate Surveyor/Kai Tak Airport (District Lands Office, Kowloon East) (Tel: 2300 1718)</p>	<p>Lands Department Lands Administration Office District Lands Office, Kowloon East 10th floor, Yau Ma Tei Carpark Building 250 Shanghai Street Kowloon</p>
<p>Mr. LEUNG Wing Yuen, Walter Sr Engr / Dist Monitoring Group on Housing Sites & SD (Kln) (Tel: 2301 1453)</p>	<p>Civil Engineering and Development Department Kowloon Development Office Kai Tak Office Kowloon Division 2 7th Floor, Empire Centre 68 Mody Road, Tsim Sha Tsui Kowloon</p>



中華人民共和國香港特別行政區政府總部教育局
Education Bureau
Government Secretariat, The Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region
The People's Republic of China

本局檔號 Our Ref.: (13) in EDB(SB) 60/3911/51 XXX

電話 Telephone: 3509 8428

來函檔號 Your Ref.:

傳真 Fax Line: 2573 3467

Arup-Mott MacDonald Joint Venture
Level 5 Festival Walk
80 Tat Chee Avenue
Kowloon Tong
Kowloon, Hong Kong
(Attn. Mr. Eric CHAN)

28 May 2012

Fax : 2268 3954

Dear Mr. CHAN,


Agreement No. CE 43/2010(HY)
Central Kowloon Route – Design and Construction
Environmental Impact Assessment
Second Round of Response to Comments for Confirmation on the Noise Mitigation
Measures on Planned Schools

We refer to your letter referenced 217722/6.20/EC/HL/FC/CWK/RH/0440 dated 21 May 2012 regarding the caption. Please be advised that we have no particular comment on the noise mitigation measures for NSR ID W-P7C.

#0886

ARUP		Job No.	217722
Reply Ref.:		File No.	
Action Required:		By:	Date 6/20
Received 28 MAY 2012			
Intr.	Att: Matt Enuro		
Action			
Info.			
Copy			

Yours sincerely,


(Miss Glenda BOW)
for Secretary for Education

c.c.
HyD/MW (Attn : Mr. Michael LEUNG)

Fax : 2714 5198

香港添馬添美道 2 號政府總部東翼六樓
6th floor, East Wing, Central Government Offices, 2 Tim Mei Avenue, Tamar, Hong Kong
網址 : <http://www.edb.gov.hk> 電子郵件 : edbinfo@edb.gov.hk
Web site : <http://www.edb.gov.hk> E-mail : edbinfo@edb.gov.hk