## Confirmed Minutes of the 141<sup>st</sup> Meeting of the Environmental Impact Assessment Subcommittee on 16 October 2017 at 9:30 a.m.

#### **Present:**

Professor TAM Fung-yee, Nora, B.B.S., J.P. (Chairperson)

Dr HUNG Wing-tat, M.H. (Deputy Chairman)

Ir Cary CHAN, J.P.

Ms Julia LAU

Dr Michael LAU

Professor Kenneth LEUNG

Ir Professor Irene LO, J.P.

Ir MA Lee-tak, S.B.S.

Professor John NG

Mr Luther WONG, J.P.

Professor WONG Sze-chun, B.B.S., J.P.

Ms Becky LAM (Secretary)

## **Absent with Apologies:**

Dr Billy HAU

Mr Andrew LEE

Professor Albert LEE

Ir Michelle TANG

Dr Eric TSANG

Mr Simon WONG, J.P.

#### In Attendance:

Mrs Alice CHEUNG, J.P. Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (3)
Mr C F WONG Assistant Director (Environmental Assessment),

Environmental Protection Department (EPD)

Mr Simon CHAN Assistant Director (Conservation), Agriculture,

Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD)

Mr Stanley LAU Acting Principal Environmental Protection Officer

(Strategic Assessment), EPD

Mr HO Man Wu Environmental Protection Officer (Strategic

Assessment), EPD

Ms Aidia CHAN Acting Senior Nature Conservation Officer (North),

**AFCD** 

Ms CHAN Yu Nam Nature Conservation Officer (Yuen Long), AFCD

Miss Dora CHU Executive Officer (CBD) 1, EPD Miss Apple LEUNG Executive Officer (CBD) 2, EPD

#### In Attendance for Item 3:

Project Proponent Team

Civil Engineering and Mr Michael FONG, Deputy Project Manager (NTW)

Development Department Mr W K LAU, Chief Engineer/New Territories West

1(NTW)

Mr W L CHUI, Senior Engineer/Dist Monitoring

Group on Housing Sites/West(NTW) Mr Nick LI, Engineer/23 (NTW)

Planning Department

(PlanD)

(CEDD)

Mr K T YAU, Chief Engineer/ CID Mr Edmund LEE, Town Planner/ CID4

Ove Arup & Partners Hong

Kong Limited

Mr Franki CHIU, Director Ms Theresa YEUNG, Director Mr Davis LEE, Associate Director Mr Peter CHAN, Associate Director

Ms Claudia YU, Designer Mr Lawrence KAN, Consultant Mr Gerald KAM, Consultant Mr Elvis LAU, Consultant

Ms Helen IP, Assistant Town Planner

AEC Limited Mr David STANTON, Director

Ms Grace LEUNG, Associate

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Action

<u>The Chairperson</u> welcomed Members to the meeting and informed that apologies of absence had been received from Dr Billy Hau, Mr Andrew Lee, Prof Albert Lee, Ir Michelle Tang, Dr Eric Tsang and Mr Simon Wong.

# <u>Item 1: Confirmation of the draft minutes of the 140<sup>th</sup> meeting held on 11 September 2017</u>

2. The draft minutes were confirmed subject to the amendments proposed by a Member in paragraphs 22, 29 and 51 of the draft minutes.

## **Item 2: Matters arising**

3. <u>The Chairperson</u> informed Members that the EIA report on "Improvement Dredging for Lamma Power Station Navigation Channel" was approved by the Director of Environmental Protection with conditions in the Environmental Permit (EP) on 10 October 2017. The relevant letter was issued to Members on 12 October 2017.

## <u>Item 3: Discussion on EIA report on "Housing Sites in Yuen Long South"</u> (ACE-EIA Paper 6/2017)

- 4. <u>The Chairperson</u> advised that during the public inspection period from 8 August to 6 September 2017, a total of 13 public comments including two late comments had been received by EPD and the gist of major issues / concerns had been circulated to Members before the meeting.
- 5. <u>The Chairperson</u> reported that ACE Members were invited to attend a half-day pre-meeting site visit cum briefing on 21 September 2017. Seven members had joined the visit on that day.
- 6. <u>The Chairperson</u> informed that the discussion would be divided into the Presentation and Question-and-Answer Session which would be opened to the public while the Internal Discussion Session would remain closed.
- The Chairperson invited declaration of interest from Members. Two Members declared that they were involved in the consultancy projects with the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) and Ove Arup and Partners Hong Kong Limited (ARUP) respectively which did not involve the EIA report to be discussed. A Member, being a member of the World Wide Fund (WWF) advised that WWF had submitted comments to EPD on the EIA report to be discussed. He also advised that WWF's project on Mai Po Nature Reserve infrastructure upgrade had engaged various consultants including ARUP. The meeting agreed that the three Members concerned could stay on and continue participating in the discussion.
- 8. <u>The Chairperson</u> reminded Members to keep confidentiality of the discussion on the EIA report to be discussed.

[The project proponent team joined the meeting at this juncture.]

## **Presentation Session** (Open Session)

9. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> gave an opening remark and with the aid of a powerpoint presentation. <u>Mr Franki Chiu</u> briefed Members on the background and need of the project, key findings of the EIA and public concerns raised during the public inspection period.

#### **Question-and-Answer Session (Open Session)**

## Creating a sustainable, green and liveable community

10. <u>A Member</u> thanked the project proponent for their detailed presentation and appreciated their planning vision and mission of enhancing the sustainability of the development. He considered that environmental and social sustainability

were equally important, in addition to economic development. Mr Michael Fong assured Members that the Government would strive to transform Yuen Long South (YLS) into a sustainable, green and liveable community. CEDD would closely liaise with AFCD, PlanD and relevant government and non-government organisations in developing various environmental and green measures in YLS area.

- 11. <u>A Member</u> asked about the progress of the feasibility studies on accommodating brownfield operations in multi-storey buildings (MSBs) and the incorporation of green building design elements into the MSBs with a view to reducing the energy consumption. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> replied that CEDD was currently undertaking two feasibility studies on proposed MSBs in Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area (HSK NDA) and in a site in the vicinity of Yuen Long Industrial Estate for accommodating some of the brownfield operations to be affected by the HSK NDA and/or YLS Development projects. The MSBs studies were expected to be completed within 2018. He said that the incorporation of green building design elements would be one of the areas to be considered in formulating the conceptual design of the proposed MSBs currently being studied.
- 12. <u>A Member</u> enquired if the Government had any plans on introducing green design and green labelling for the housing provided. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> explained that the Government would ensure compliance with existing guidelines, such as the green design guidelines set out for public housing developments which stipulated that the overall greening coverage target to be at least 30%. In view that the project would span over a long period of time, CEDD would maintain close communication with other bureaux and departments (B/Ds) to encourage them to enhance the green building designs and environmental features for the housing development and other public facilities under their purview.
- 13. <u>A Member</u> suggested and <u>another Member</u> supported that the requirement for conducting BEAM Plus assessment for the neighbourhood and existing buildings should be included as one of the terms in leasing documents and the Deed of Mutual Covenant respectively to ensure that the buildings were built and managed in a sustainable manner.
- 14. <u>A Member</u> expressed appreciation towards the project proponent's commitment to reuse treated sewage effluent as reclaimed water within the development area.

#### Noise impacts

15. <u>A Member</u> expressed concern that the inclusion of storage and workshop uses at the Employment Belt would inevitably generate traffic of heavy goods vehicles within YLS which in turn would create noise and air quality impacts. He considered that there was a need to restrict these heavy goods vehicles from accessing and parking at the residential areas and other noise sensitive receivers.

He also mentioned that residents should be encouraged to commute to the Employment Belt by means of public transport.

- 16. Mr Peter Chan explained that the ratio of goods vehicles at the Employment Belt would account for around 30% of the total traffic. The circulation of heavy goods vehicles within residential areas would be mainly for delivery purposes and was estimated at around 1% to 2% of the total traffic. In order to minimize freight traffic routing through residential areas, road network was specially designed to allow direct access to the Employment Belt from the Tong Yan San Tsuen (TYST) Interchange and Tin Shui Wai West (TSWW) Interchange.
- Mr Michael Fong supplemented that as brownfield operations near TYST would be accommodated in MSBs at the Employment Belt, the entry of heavy goods vehicles into YLS via the new road at TYST was not anticipated. However, as there would be retail and catering establishments within YLS, it was not feasible to impose restriction on the entry of goods vehicles. Having said that, he agreed to liaise with the Transport Department (TD) to optimize the traffic arrangements. To encourage the use of public transport, it was planned to provide public transport interchange (PTI) at each of the three designated areas near the residential areas within YLS.
- 18. <u>Mr Peter Chan</u> said that the anticipated percentage of commuting by public transport was around 80%. To enhance integrated development with HSK NDA, around 30% of the public transport trips would be from YLS to the HSK NDA which provided about 150,000 new employment opportunities.
- 19. <u>A Member</u> suggested the project proponent minimize the spare capacities of the district distributor roads within the project development area to avoid illegitimate village expansions or other undesirable uses, in particular for Road D1 which was dead-ended at its southern end. He also suggested setting a traffic speed limit of 50 kilometres per hour for all internal roads within YLS with a view to minimizing the traffic noise impacts to noise sensitive receivers.
- 20. Mr Michael Fong explained that the extent of roads within YLS had been kept at a minimum and the volume-to-capacity (V/C) ratio of the district distributor roads was about 0.6. Further increasing the V/C ratio at the expense of one traffic lane might lead to possible unstable traffic flow and inadequacy in meeting the traffic demand of the planned development.
- 21. Mr Peter Chan said that Road D1 was designed as a dual two lane carriageway. He agreed to review whether the width of Road D1 could be minimized by reducing the space reserved for planters and other amenities.

## Landscape and visual impacts

- (i) Design of noise barriers
- 22. <u>A Member</u> considered the extensive use of noise barriers and enclosures along the proposed primary and district distributor roads would generate negative visual impacts. He suggested the project proponent consider ways to minimize the negative impacts, including for instance reducing the extent of the noise barriers by road depression and/or adopting other noise mitigation measures.
- 23. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> agreed that the design of the noise barriers would be optimized during the detailed design stage with a view to minimizing the visual impacts.
- A Member suggested that the visual impacts created by the proposed noise barriers within YLS could be minimized by deploying a softer design. Using Figures 10.14f and 10.14h as illustration, he further opined that the photomontages showing the proposed development with mitigation should better reflect the expected results of the mitigation measures over time and thereby giving a more realistic projection to the public and Members. With reference to the mitigation measure code "OM6" in the EIA report which was "aesthetic design of built development", the Member commented that concrete measures for mitigating landscape and visual impacts should be developed.

## (ii) Revitalisation of Nullahs

- 25. <u>A Member</u> opined with the concurrence of <u>another Member</u> that the Government should enhance water-friendly facilities in relation to the revitalisation of nullahs e.g. by constructing facilities to regulate the water flow. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> explained that notwithstanding the constraint to limit accessing down to the revitalized channel due to the inherited flood risk, CEDD would liaise with Drainage Services Department (DSD) to further explore the feasibility of promoting water-friendly activities in addition to revitalisation of the nullahs.
- Noting that the Yuen Long Nullah along Kung Um Road was a major feature extended to the Yuen Long New Town, a Member enquired about the landscaping features that would be adopted in designing the nullah in connection with the water channels. Mr Michael Fong said the DSD was undertaking a concurrent project on the improvement of Yuen Long Town Nullah. Reference would be made to DSD's Guidelines on Environmental and Ecological Considerations for River Channel Design to ensure that the concept of revitalising water-friendly culture in large-scale drainage improvement works would be adopted for planning drainage networks for YLS. He emphasized that they would continue to collaborate with DSD to ensure the beautification and revitalisation for the nullah would integrate with the overall landscape framework.

- 27. <u>A Member</u> asked whether the nullahs would be narrowed in order to allow space for the provision of footpaths along them, pointing out that such narrowing might affect the river bed and gradient of the slopes of the banks.
- 28. Mr Peter Chan advised that there was a need to rebuild the nullahs and the proposed design would account for the need to preserve the hydraulic function, enhance the ecological function with the use of natural substrate and provide space for landscaping. It might be possible that the existing trapezoid shape of the nullahs could be modified and the optimal design would be developed in the detailed design stage.
- 29. <u>A Member</u> suggested and <u>another Member</u> supported the introduction of spatial articulations along the elongated nullah with a view to creating a natural outlook and enhancing the visual quality. <u>Mr Peter Chan</u> replied that the existing width of the Yuen Long Nullah widened gradually from the southern to the northern end. Meandering and inclusion of rock pools at the channel bed would be considered to enhance its natural outlook. He added that a 4 metres-wide footpath would be proposed alongside the Yuen Long Nullah at its southern section to promote a water-friendly culture, and a planter area of 2.5 to 3 metres wide would be provided for landscaping and greening.
- 30. <u>A Member</u> opined that the planter areas should be maximized as far as practicable, and if technically feasible, the banks of the nullahs should be provided with adequate soil layer for sustainable planting. He also suggested partial-decking over some sections of the nullahs for the provision of more public space and amenities.
- 31. Given that there was more space at the southern end of the Yuen Long Nullah, a Member followed that the introduction of stepped platforms could be considered with a view to increasing the interaction with the nullah.
- 32. <u>A Member</u> suggested the project proponent make reference to Cheonggyecheon which was a revitalized stream in Seoul with special features serving different functions along different sections of the stream.
- 33. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> informed Members that DSD had commissioned a comparative study of revitalization of urban streams in the major cities in Asia. The project proponent would keep in collaboration with DSD and take into account the recommendations of the study in the development of the project.
- (iii) Breezeways
- 34. In response to <u>a Member</u>'s enquiry on the directions of breezeways, <u>Mr</u> <u>Peter Chan</u> replied that Air Ventilation Assessment (AVA) including wind tunnel had been conducted to identify breezeways for the project. While the annual prevailing wind was penetrating from the East, summer prevailing wind was

penetrating from Southwest. Given that the residential zones would involve high density urban developments, the Member further enquired if adverse effects would arise and whether air ventilation movements along summer prevailing wind from the Southwest would be blocked. Mr Chan replied in the negative and confirmed that recommendations from AVA and micro-climate studies had been incorporated in the planning of the draft Recommended Outline Development Plan (RODP) to enhance local air ventilation performance.

## Connectivity and walkability

- 35. A Member enquired about the connectivity of YLS and its integration with Yuen Long New Town. Mr Michael Fong said that CEDD would conduct a consultancy study to assess the feasibility of providing and enhancing comprehensive networks of pedestrian walkways and cycle tracks in YLS to tie in with HSK NDA in light of the close proximity between the two sites. Cycle tracks within YLS would be connected to the existing cycle tracks along Castle Peak Road. However, he said that the high density developments in Yuen Long New Town would impose a severe constraint for allowing more space for improving the connectivity within and to the New Town. Mr Fong added that the Highways Department was going to construct an elevated pedestrian corridor along the Nullah in Yuen Long New Town. CEDD would liaise with the relevant B/Ds in developing a comprehensive pedestrian network throughout YLS and connecting with the existing / proposed pedestrian corridor in Yuen Long New Town.
- 36. <u>A Member</u> enquired about the project proponent's planning and urban design principles in facilitating the connectivity amongst the three activity nodes by utilizing district open space and integrating with the Yuen Long New Town and the watercourses.
- Ms Theresa Yeung explained that the current design of the project site aimed to provide an area of open space that would be conveniently accessible not only for the future population but also existing residents and villagers in and near YLS. They had consulted local villagers who expressed support for designating open spaces in the centre of YLS as a communal place. Open space corridors (zoned "Local Open Space" ("LO")) would be provided to serve as buffer between the existing low-rise villages and high-rise public and private housing developments in future. In addition, a linear green link was designed along the nullah that would be integrated with the pedestrian and cycle track networks. This would enhance the enjoyment of walking and cycling and enhance the connectivity between YLS and Yuen Long New Town. She further supplemented that each community was anchored with a key activity node comprising of a PTI, and also local adjoining open spaces for commercial and community uses in connection with mixed commercial and residential development.
- 38. <u>A Member</u> noted that the activity node on the top left of the RODP (i.e. Area 1) was located next to a road and asked whether more open spaces could be

allocated for each activity node to serve its function. Mr K T Yau said that district open space would be provided in each of the three residential communities and would be linked up by the local open space and green space, including strip of local open space along the roadside at the southern part of Kung Um Road. He added that the locations of the activity nodes serving each of the three residential communities were drawn up having regard to factors, including easy accessibility for the planned residential developments and the nearby villages, as well as constraints imposed by the existing roads and villages. He supplemented that the bus routes for proposed PTIs at the activity nodes would be planned with an aim to improving easy accessibility and accommodating the needs of existing villagers and future residents.

- 39. A Member was of the view that the southern dead-end of the project site at YLS was a constraint to the development of the environmentally friendly transport services (EFTS). He suggested the Government consider incorporating a "Bus Rapid Transit" system to enhance integration with the proposed HSK railway station, including making use of spare capacities of the district distributor roads and incorporation of traffic management strategies in terms of road design and junction management to facilitate a fast and convenient trip for passengers to the proposed HSK railway station. In response, Mr Michael Fong explained that CEDD was undertaking a feasibility study on the EFTS in HSK NDA and adjacent areas which included the potential extension of EFTS from HSK NDA to YLS. The proposed green public transport mode and alignment of EFTS including considerations of adopting a rail-based system or electric buses had yet been finalised. He emphasized that one of the key considerations in the introduction of EFTS was to provide an efficient and convenient public transport services that would contribute to a low-carbon community.
- 40. On behalf of <u>another Member</u> who was unable to attend the meeting, <u>a Member</u> suggested that there should be a more prominent entrance to the Tai Lam Country Park and facilities such as barbecue sites and pavilions to attract more nearby residents and visitors to the country park. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> agreed and said that they would follow up with the AFCD and other relevant B/Ds.

## Ecological impacts

- 41. While noting that the egretry near Pak Sha Tsuen was over 120 metres from the proposed site formation and construction works, a Member suggested that a precautionary approach should be adopted by avoiding high noise construction activities such as percussive piling in the vicinity of the egretry. Another Member concurred and said that such activities should be avoided especially during the breeding season.
- 42. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> replied that the indirect impacts to the egretry were assessed as low and good site practices were proposed to be implemented as precautionary measures. Mitigation measures such as the deployment of low noise

construction method and noise barriers were proposed to be deployed to mitigate the noise impact to the egretry during site formation.

- 43. Noting that "wasteland" was usually defined as land with low ecological value and low vegetation cover, <u>a Member</u> pointed out that some of the "wasteland" within the project site were highly vegetated and with species of conservation concern. They were used by egrets and other ardeid species as the foraging habitat. He also asked about the distinction between "wasteland" and "inactive agricultural land".
- 44. <u>Ms Grace Leung</u> explained that "wasteland" was defined as fallow agricultural land and cleared woodland that had become overgrown with weedy vegetation after a long period of abandonment. Inactive agricultural land was fallow fields with visible traces of farming as they were more recently abandoned as compared with wasteland. The overgrowth of weedy vegetation in inactive agricultural land was therefore less severe than that in wasteland. A tree specimen of conservation importance, *Artocarpus hypargyreus* could be found within the wasteland as remnant of village plantation after site clearance. A rare tree species, namely *Ailanthus fordii* was also found within the existing rural industrial development within YLS.
- Addressing a Member's concern that the methodology of the flightline survey might not be adequate for identifying the foraging grounds of ardeids, Mr David Stanton explained that the flightline survey was conducted to observe bird dispersion within 100 to 120 metres from the egretry with a view to identifying suitable areas for designating flight corridors and the district open space ("DO"). He mentioned that the observation point for conducting the flightline survey was situated at a vantage point on a knoll that enabled clear observation of bird dispersion from the egretry to foraging habitats. He added that more surveys would be conducted to update the status of the egretry, and appropriate mitigation measures detailed in the Environmental Monitoring and Audit (EM&A) manual would be envisaged accordingly. If deemed necessary, construction activities near the egretry during the breeding season i.e. between April and July could be avoided and the condition of the egretry would be closely monitored to ascertain if further mitigation measures were adequate.
- 46. With the observation that the proposed residential area designated as R2c in the RODP might have impacts on the flight corridor of ardeids heading to the foraging grounds at the northern and north-western areas, a Member suggested consideration be given to setting back the residential area to allow room for expansion of the neighbouring DO. He also suggested the project proponent adopt a stepped height profile with residential building heights diminishing towards the egretry.
- 47. <u>Mr David Stanton</u> clarified that the flight lines only indicated a broad direction of flight of the egretry. Furthermore, the egretry had been diminishing

with less than 20 breeding pairs of ardeids in 2017 and there were only 10 to 15 recorded movements along the concerned flightline in the first few hours of the flightline survey. With a DO ranging from 82 to 120 metres wide, he considered that the width of the flight corridor for ardeids to the northern and north-western areas should be adequate for prevailing and future growth of the egretry.

- 48. Mr Peter Chan supplemented that the overall environment of the southern areas of YLS would be improved with a view to creating new foraging grounds for ardeids and attracting them from the northern to southern areas. For instance, the setting of the Hillside River Corridor, retention lake and the nullahs, especially at the southern end of the Yuen Long Nullah, would be as natural as possible. Planting of bamboo and/or bamboo clumps around the retention lake was proposed as an enhancement measure to provide nesting habitat for ardeids.
- 49. <u>A Member</u> suggested the project proponent consider early planting of bamboo and sizeable trees at potential nesting sites to minimize the impact of the construction activities on the egretry.
- 50. Mr Michael Fong agreed that it was important to conserve the egretry before and during the construction of the project. Considering that the project was still at a planning stage, the project proponent had liaised with AFCD to step up the monitoring of the egretry. He also agreed to follow up with the suggestion of early planting during project construction which would be implemented in four stages from 2020 to 2038 in the detailed design stage.
- 51. <u>A Member</u> suggested that benchmarks and standards should be clearly set for measuring the effectiveness of translocating fauna and flora species of conservation interest, especially for the endemic crab species.
- Mr David Stanton advised that a few species of plants that would be affected by the project development were proposed to be transplanted at suitable receptor sites within YLS. The endemic crab species if found would be translocated to the Hillside River Corridor or three lowland watercourses to be retained. As these species were robust and could survive in a wide range of conditions, a high success rate of translocation was anticipated. There would be a monitoring period to ascertain that there were no negative impacts on the transplanted / translocated populations.
- 53. <u>A Member</u> considered that the species used for landscaping should take into account urban ecology on top of visual quality. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> replied that the enhancement of urban ecology such as by introducing native species would be considered during the detailed design stage.

#### Impact on agriculture

54. A Member was concerned that the construction of new roads with a higher

elevation to the neighbouring agricultural land might affect the topography and thereby lead to possible changes in the hydrology and irrigation system. The chance of flooding at the agricultural land might also increase as a result. He suggested the project proponent conduct a study on the possible impacts on the agricultural land and propose corresponding mitigation measures.

- 55. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> replied that considerations including the hydrology and ecological connectivity would be taken into account when drawing up the road design during the detailed design stage.
- Mr Peter Chan supplemented that the elevation of the new roads at the agricultural zones would be kept to a minimum to reduce the embankment spatial requirement, and if deemed necessary, the use of abutments would be incorporated into the design to reduce space take-up. It was anticipated that the new roads would only be slightly higher than the existing footpaths at the agricultural zones.
- 57. Noting the proposed Road D1 was re-aligned which would result in the fragmentation of the Shan Ha Tsuen agricultural land, a Member was concerned that it might be difficult to generate economies of scale in farming. In response, Mr Michael Fong said the agricultural land concerned comprised an area of about three hectares and the larger western portion of agricultural land would be retained which involved an extensive scale of farming. In addition, ecological linkage and hydrology between the eastern and western portions would be maintained and addressed in the detailed design of Road D1.

## Air quality impact

- 58. <u>The Chairperson</u> referred to a public comment on the odour impacts generated by the construction of two sewage pumping stations within YLS, and invited the project proponent to respond.
- 59. Mr Franki Chiu advised that with proper deodourising facilities, sewage pumping stations would not be a major source of odour nuisance. He added that the planned sensitive receivers were located at least 50 metres from the new sewage pumping stations and adverse impacts on them was not anticipated. As regards the odour emission from proposed sewage treatment works located at the south of YLS, appropriate mitigation measures had been proposed to address the odour emission.

#### Waste management

60. In view that 88,000 future population would be accommodated in YLS in addition to those at nearby HSK NDA, a Member urged the project proponent to devise an integrated waste management plan in collaboration with the EPD through comprehensive and holistic planning, including but not limited to the design and provision of waste management facilities for the collection and

recycling of solid waste and food waste. <u>Mr Michael Fong</u> said that CEDD would continue to maintain close collaboration with EPD on waste management. He advised that a feasibility study would be undertaken by DSD on the sewage treatment for HSK NDA and YLS, and co-digestion of food waste would be one of the areas to be studied.

61. <u>A Member</u> followed that the project proponent should explore the feasibility of composing organic waste for reuse in community farming. This should be considered during the preliminary design stage for better planning of the spatial allocations and other resources.

#### Land contamination

Noting the problem of land contamination in more than 700 brownfield sites scattered across YLS, a Member asked if any study had been carried out to identify the possible sources of contamination and appropriate remediation measures. Mr Michael Fong replied in the affirmative. Notwithstanding the difficulty in sampling on these sites given that over 80% of YLS were under private ownership, assessments had been conducted by consultants making reference to the aerial photos taken since 1960s, which indicated that the overall extent of contamination was rather localized. He added that on-site testing and sampling would be undertaken, and the relevant information and reports would be submitted to EPD for approval. A wide range of proper remediation measures would be implemented to decontaminate each site to an acceptable level in accordance with the timeline for development.

#### Conclusion

63. There being no further questions from Members, <u>the Chairperson</u> thanked the project proponent team for their presentation and clarification on the project.

[The project proponent team left the meeting at this juncture.]

## <u>Internal Discussion Session</u> (Closed-door session)

- 64. <u>The Chairperson</u> advised that the EIA Subcommittee could make recommendations to ACE on the EIA report with the following consideration:
  - (i) endorse the EIA report without condition; or
  - (ii) endorse the EIA report with conditions and/or recommendations; or
  - (iii) defer the decision to the full Council for further consideration highlight issues or reasons for not reaching a consensus or issues to be further considered by the full Council; or
  - (iv) reject the EIA report and inform the project proponent of the right to go to the full Council.

- 65. In reply to Members' enquiry, <u>Mr C F Wong</u> clarified that the project was a designated project (DP) under Schedule 3 of the EIA Ordinance (EIAO). The development of the PDA also covered 10 other DPs under Schedule 2 of the EIAO, which included the construction of new roads, sewage treatment works and sewage pumping stations etc.
- 66. <u>The Chairperson</u> proposed and <u>Members</u> agreed to endorse the EIA report with conditions and recommendations which were detailed below.

## Creating a sustainable, green and liveable community

- 67. <u>The Chairperson</u> suggested and <u>Members</u> supported to make the following recommendations:
  - (i) ensure the sustainability of the buildings and neighbourhood development by achieving at minimum "Gold" rating under the BEAM Plus rating system for new buildings and neighbourhood; and include in the Deed of Mutual Covenant terms and/or lease documents for conducting BEAM Plus (existing buildings) assessment with a view to ensuring that the buildings are managed in a sustainable manner after the buildings have been occupied; and
  - (ii) reuse rain water and grey water in-situ for purposes such as irrigation and toilet flushing.

#### Noise impacts

68. With reference to the written comment submitted by <u>a Member</u>, <u>the Chairperson</u> suggested requiring the project proponent to submit a detailed noise mitigation measures plan with a view to minimizing the adverse noise impacts of the district distributor roads to nearby sensitive receivers.

#### Landscape and visual impacts

Member before the meeting, the Chairperson suggested and Members supported requiring the project proponent to introduce special features and spatial articulations along the nullahs and existing watercourses with a view to generating a natural outlook, enhancing the ecological functions while preserving the hydraulic performance and be responsible for the operation and maintenance of the facilities. A Member further suggested that adequate space should be allocated for creating a water-friendly culture and enhancing sustainability.

- Mr C F Wong advised that as the Yuen Long Nullah revitalization along Kung Um Road / Kiu Hing Road constituted a Schedule 2 DP and an EP would be required for its construction, the project proponent could be required to submit a landscape and visual plan to address the issues raised by Members. He however mentioned that the preservation of watercourses was not a DP under the EIAO. In the event that the project proponent decided to apply for a separate EP for the Yuen Long Nullah revitalization rather than for the entire project, no condition could be imposed on the preservation of watercourses by means of issuing an EP.
- 71. <u>A Member</u> suggested and <u>other Members</u> supported the reduction of the extent of noise barriers with a view to minimizing the negative visual impacts. <u>A Member</u> said that the landscape and visual quality of the proposed activity nodes should also be enhanced.
- 72. In light of Members' comments, Mr C F Wong suggested that Members consider requiring the project proponent to submit a landscape and visual plan of the district distributor roads and the nearby activity nodes with a view to reducing the extent or the negative visual impacts of the noise barriers and/or enclosures, thereby showing the enhanced landscape and visual quality of the district distributor roads and the nearby activity nodes. The Plan should include but not limited to a review to minimize the spare capacities of the district distributor roads within the project development area, controlling the entry of heavy vehicles into the residential areas and strengthening residents' accessibility to the public transport interchange system.

#### Connectivity and walkability

- 73. <u>A Member</u> suggested and <u>other Members</u> agreed to recommend the project proponent to facilitate the integration of the activity nodes with nearby area by considering better spatial allocation and design of district open spaces to enhance the connectivity and accessibility by nearby residents.
- 74. <u>The Chairperson</u> suggested and <u>Members</u> agreed to recommend the project proponent to facilitate better connection between the Tai Lam Country Park and the nearby artificial wetland for residents and visitors.

## Ecological impacts

75. The Chairperson suggested the project proponent conduct a survey to

ascertain the existence of egretry at Tai Tong area and update the baseline information before commencement of construction of the relevant phase of the project. Subject to the survey results, <u>a Member</u> said that low noise construction method should be deployed in the vicinity of the egretry during their breeding season.

- 76. <u>A Member</u> also suggested recommending the project proponent to adopt a stepped height profile with building heights diminishing towards the egretry.
- 77. With reference to <u>a Member</u>'s earlier comment, <u>the Chairperson</u> suggested recommending the project proponent to consider early planting of suitable species of trees, bamboo and plants at potential nesting sites for ardeids to minimize the impact of construction activities on the egretry.
- 78. <u>The Chairperson</u> further proposed and <u>Members</u> supported to recommend the project proponent to adopt the urban ecology concept for planting within the project site.

## Impacts on agriculture

79. <u>The Chairperson</u> proposed and <u>Members</u> supported to recommend the project proponent to mitigate the environmental, operational and cultural impacts on the agricultural land within the project site, especially during the construction stage, with respect to the flooding risks and impact on the irrigation system resulting from the possible changes in hydrology.

#### Waste Management

- 80. <u>The Chairperson</u> proposed and <u>Members</u> supported to develop a plan for integrated solid waste management within the project site including food waste collection, separation and recycling.
- 81. The meeting agreed that the project proponent team would not be required to attend the full Council meeting for this report.

[Post meeting note: The list of proposed conditions and recommendations was circulated to Members for comments on 20 October 2017.]

## **Item 4 : Any other business**

82. A Member remarked that the information regarding the alignment of

Action

breezeways were seldom included in the EIA report. He requested the ACE secretariat to obtain such information from the project proponents in future, if Secretariat available.

83. Addressing a Member's concern on the proposal of vague mitigation measures by project proponents such as "aesthetic design of built development", Mr C F Wong agreed to follow up with the PlanD to encourage the adoption of a clearer definition in future submissions.

#### Review of Guidance Notes and guidelines

- 84. With reference to the classification of habitats such as wasteland, a Member suggested EPD and AFCD consider including clear definitions in relevant Guidance Notes and guidelines.
- 85. In reply to a Member's enquiry on the latest programme of the on-going review of those Guidance Notes for ecological assessment, Mr C F Wong advised that an engagement process would commence to collect feedback from stakeholders on the initial finding of the review, and it was the current working EPD target to complete the review before end of 2018.

## Report on Members' comments on project profiles

The Chairperson recapped that it had been agreed at the EIASC meeting 86. held on 14 August 2017 that the Secretariat should henceforth issue for ACE Members' information the comments of individual ACE Members on project profiles as well as the corresponding EIA Study Brief subsequently issued under the EIAO. She informed the meeting that information on the EIA Study Brief for the project "Intermodal Transfer Terminal - Bonded Vehicular Bridge and Associated Roads" was circulated to ACE on 12 October 2017. During the public inspection period of the concerned project profile from 31 August to 13 September 2017, no comments from ACE Members had been received by the EIAO Register Office.

#### Item 5: Date of next meeting

87. The Chairperson advised Members that the EIASC meeting on 13 November 2017 would be cancelled as there was no EIA report pending discussion. Members would be advised on the date of the next meeting and the agenda in due course.

## **EIA Subcommittee Secretariat** November 2017