

# ACE Paper 11/2013 For advice on 9 September 2013

# Report on the 124<sup>th</sup> Environmental Impact Assessment Subcommittee Meeting

#### **PURPOSE**

The Environmental Impact Assessment Subcommittee (EIASC) considered the following two EIA reports under section 6(2) of the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO) at the meeting on 19 August 2013 –

- (i) North East New Territories New Development Areas (hereafter known as the NENT NDAs project) (ACE-EIA Paper 5/2013 refers); and
- (ii) Lok Ma Chau Loop (hereafter known as the LMC Loop project) (ACE-EIA Paper 6/2013 refers).
- 2. Both reports were submitted by the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD).
- 3. Members are requested to consider the views of the EIASC at paragraphs 13 to 15 below and advise on way forward for handling the two EIA reports.

#### BACKGROUND OF AND NEED FOR THE PROJECTS

# A. North East New Territories New Development Areas (NENT NDAs)

- 4. The study report covers Kwu Tung North (KTN) NDA and Fanling North (FLN) NDA. The KTN NDA has an area of some 450 ha and is proposed to accommodate a population of 101 600, while FLN NDA has an area of some 164 ha with a proposed population of 73 300.
- 5. The overall objective of the project is to establish a planning and

development framework for KTN and FLN NDAs to meet long-term housing, social, economic and environmental needs, and to formulate an implementation programme for the NDAs. The two NDAs will become the extension of Fanling (FL)/Sheung Shui (SS) New Town to form the FL/SS/KT New Town as an integrated community providing a wide range of employment opportunities, as well as commercial, community, recreational and cultural facilities supporting a larger population. Long Valley will be designated a Nature Park to conserve this ecologically important site as well as to provide opportunities for compensating loss of wetland habitats due to the NDA developments. There will also be opportunities to promote a low carbon and green community in the NDAs, such as reuse of treated sewage effluent, low emission transport system as well as low carbon built form and design, etc..

## B. Lok Ma Chau Loop (LMC Loop)

- 6. The LMC Loop lies within the administrative boundary of the Hong Kong Administrative Region which was once within the Shenzhen's jurisdiction before 1997.
- 7. The LMC Loop covers some 87.7 ha of land. The project plans to have local higher education as the leading land use, to be complemented by high-tech research and development (R&D) facilities as well as cultural and creative (C&C) industries. Similar to the NENT NDAs project, low carbon and green community will be promoted in the Loop.
- 8. Please refer to the ACE-EIA papers 5 & 6/2013 on the two EIA reports at **Annexes A-B** for project details.

### VIEWS OF THE DIRECTOR OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

9. The Director of Environmental Protection (DEP), in conjunction with the relevant authorities, considers that the two EIA reports have met the respective requirements of the EIA Study Brief and the Technical Memorandum on EIA Process (TM). Comments from the public and ACE will be taken into account by DEP in deciding whether or not to approve the EIA reports under the EIAO.

#### VIEWS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE

10. Public inspection period of the two EIA reports was from 5 July to 3 August 2013. Public comments on the two projects received by the Environmental

Protection Department during the inspection period and the gist of the comments were issued to Members on 12 and 13 August 2013 for reference before the meeting.

11. A summary of issues discussed by the EIASC at the meeting on the NENT NDAs project and the LMC Loop project is prepared at **Annex C**.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE

12. Having regard to the findings and recommendations of the two EIA reports and the information provided by CEDD, the Subcommittee agreed to recommend to the full Council as follows –

#### A. NENT NDAs project

13. The EIA report could be endorsed with the following conditions and recommendations –

#### Condition of endorsement

- (a) CEDD shall submit a detailed proposal on the methodology and monitoring strategy for the relocation of the uncommon fish species Rose Bitterling to demonstrate that the mitigation measures proposed are effective prior to commencement of construction works;
- (b) CEDD shall submit detailed arsenic treatment plan(s) for sites that require soil treatment to (i) check and confirm validity of the bioavailability assumed in the EIA report; (ii) fine-tune the treatment method/treatment level of the "cement solidification and stabilization" processes; and (iii) advise on the handling of the treated materials, prior to commencement of construction works;
- (c) CEDD shall submit, prior to commencement of construction works, a detailed proposal for the establishment of alternative egretry site(s), which should include the detailed location and design of the alternative egretry site(s) and a monitoring programme to assess and confirm the effectiveness of the mitigation measure. In the event that, based on monitoring results, the alternative egretry site(s) are found not effective, other feasible alternatives should be proposed and implemented, e.g. enhancement of the existing egretry site of Ho Sheung Heung and its vicinity; and
- (d) CEDD shall submit, prior to commencement of construction works, a compensatory tree planting plan in consultation with the relevant authorities, including but not limited to the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department, to the satisfaction of DEP before

commencement of works. The plan should include details of implementation and management of the proposed compensatory planting areas. Measures for protecting trees potentially affected by the project as well as trees to be transplanted should be adopted. Topping of trees should be avoided.

## Recommendations

- (a) CEDD should further review, at the detailed design stage, the design/alignment of Fanling Bypass with a view to avoiding to the maximum practicable extent or minimizing disturbance of the meanders of Ng Tung River. CEDD should also consider adjusting the housing developments which encroach upon the meanders, in particular at the one to the north of Ng Tung River (north-west of Wa Shan and a compensated ecology of the Ng Tung River realignment project), with a view to avoiding/minimizing the meanders to be affected;
- (b) CEDD should consider adjusting the design and alignment of Road R1 linking up to the proposed stadium at Ma Tso Lung to avoid the need to divert Ma Tso Lung Stream;
- (c) CEDD should further review the design of the traffic junction at Man Kam To Road, e.g. by adopting a signal junction instead of a roundabout or reducing the size of the roundabout, to minimize potential impacts to egrets roosting/foraging at the Man Kam To Road Egretry; and
- (d) CEDD should consider recommending the zoning of the farmland at the north of Long Valley Nature Park as "Conservation Area" (CA) instead of agricultural uses (AGR) as recommended in the Recommended Outline Development Plan (RODP) for the NDAs. The proposed "CA" zoning can provide better protection of the ecologically important habitat/birds flight path in the area
- 14. Since ACE had received a number of submissions from green groups and local communities on the social and other impacts of the project which was outside the purview of the EIA regime, the meeting would propose the Council to forward the following comments/observations to the Government for further consideration
  - (a) A comprehensive study on the phylogenetic of Rose Bitterling in their populations in Hong Kong should be conducted, for the purpose of confirming the origin and status of the species, and enhancing the corresponding guideline/policy on its conservation;
  - (b) There should be strong initiatives from the Government to identify

- suitable farmlands for those affected residents who wanted to continue with their farming practices in the NDAs; and
- (c) There should be a good synergy of the NDAs with the existing FL/SS New Town for development into a green community/neighbourhood to serve the NENT hinterland.

# **B.** LMC Loop project

- 15. CEDD should be requested to provide the following supplementary information on the study before the Subcommittee could make further recommendations to ACE on the EIA report
  - (a) CEDD to provide further assessment data and analysis to justify construction of the proposed Eastern Connection Road, including consideration of other alternatives for access to the LMC Loop, in addition to the West Connection Road; and
  - (b) CEDD to consider the feasibility of retaining part of the existing reed beds in the proposed amenity area/activity corridor.
- 16. The Subcommittee also agreed that CEDD and their consultant team should attend the full Council meeting on 9 September 2013 to explain the feasibility, practicability, programming and effectiveness of the mitigation measures in order to avoid to the maximum practicable extent, reduce or remedy the impacts, and to answer any questions which Council Members may have on the NENT NDAs EIA report.

EIA Subcommittee Secretariat August 2013