

Comparison of Site Options

	Kong Nga Po	Heung Yeung Wai	Lin Ma Hang	Tung Lung Chau	Hei Ling Chau
Land Use and Environmental Considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have potential for housing and economic development over the long term if Closed Area Policy is lifted. Recent proposals, such as the Regional Express Line proposed by the Second Railway Development Strategy and the Shenzhen-Hong Kong Eastern Corridor, will enhance this potential. • There are proposals from the One Country, Two Systems Research Institute and Hong Kong China Relation Strategic Development Research Fund, etc. advocating the opening up of the Frontier Closed Area (FCA) for various activities to foster co-operation between Hong Kong and Shenzhen. It appears that there are increasing community pressure or aspirations for closer co-operation through opening up the FCA. • The long term role of the FCA, including such aspects as its functions, extent and scope of development, timing and priority etc. will be examined in the HK 2030 Study: Planning Vision and Strategy which will be completed in 2004. • The prison development would not only pose a serious constraint but also pre-empt and jeopardise the long term development of the FCA. • The sites have the potential to be developed as boundary towns if the Regional Express Line as recommended in the Second Railway Development Strategy is materialized in future. The prison development may pre-empt such potential. 			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tung Lung Chau and its vicinity are proposed for conservation in the Study on South East New Territories Development Strategy Review (SENTDSR) due to the presence of archaeological sites, declared monuments, historical site, rare steep cliffs, sea caves as well as natural and undisturbed landscape and coastline. • The site has been agreed for designation as a country park by the Country Park Committee of the Country and Marine Parks Board. • The prison development will have a significant visual impact on the surrounding areas. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hei Ling Chau and Sunshine Island are proposed for conservation in the Study on South West New Territories Development Strategy Review (SWNTDSR) due to the presence of ecologically important habitats and the natural landscape values of the islands.

	Kong Nga Po	Heung Yeung Wai	Lin Ma Hang	Tung Lung Chau	Hei Ling Chau
Impact on Existing Settlements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some existing settlements will be affected. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A number of recognized villages will be affected. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A number of recognized villages will be affected. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Insignificant impact as compared to land-based options. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Insignificant impact as compared to land-based options.
Site Topography	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relatively flat land is available. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relatively flat land is available. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Due to rugged topography, more extensive site formation is required as compared to other land-based options. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Due to rugged topography of the island, very extensive site formation is required. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Due to rugged topography of the island, very extensive site formation is required.
Impact of Reclamation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> N.A. 			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The natural setting of the island and the coastline will be destroyed. It will reduce the width of waterways at Tathong Channel at the eastern harbour and thus affecting the marine traffic. It will have serious impact on the visually prominent gateway to the eastern harbour of Hong Kong. The existing coral communities and fisheries nearby will be affected. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The natural setting of the island and the coastline will be destroyed. The marine ecology and existing fish culture zones in the area could be affected.

	Kong Nga Po	Heung Yeung Wai	Lin Ma Hang	Tung Lung Chau	Hei Ling Chau
Site Accessibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Readily accessible by land transport 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Less accessible by land transport 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Less accessible by land transport 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Road crossing has to be provided for land transport. • Possible road crossing will bisect Tit Cham Chau which is part of Clear Water Bay Country Park and will have impact on environmental conservation and local ecology. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Road crossing has to be provided for land transport. • Possible fixed crossing via Mui Wo will have heritage and landscape impacts.
Conservation, Fisheries and Ecology	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No known ecological importance. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No known ecological importance. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a potential Site of Special Scientific Interests including the Lin Ma Hang Stream drainage basin. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tung Lung Chau and its vicinity are proposed for conservation in SENTDSR. • Coral communities between Tung Lung Chau and Tit Cham Chau and fisheries nearby will be affected. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hei Ling Chau and Sunshine Island are proposed for conservation in SWNTDSR. • Marine ecology and fish culture zones in the area could be affected. • Presence of ecologically important habitat for the rare Bogadek's Burrowing endemic to Hong Kong.

	Kong Nga Po	Heung Yeung Wai	Lin Ma Hang	Tung Lung Chau	Hei Ling Chau
Historical Features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No known historical features 			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There will be impact on archaeological sites, historical sites (including Hung Shing Temple) and declared monuments (including Tung Lung Fort and Tung Lung Rock Carving) on the island and its recreational value. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No known historical features
Overall Remarks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None of the site options identified are considered ideal. Either the development potential of the frontier will be constrained by the land-based options or the conservation value of the island sites have to be compromised. The co-location of prison development would involve very expensive trade-offs for the community which should be fully taken into account for a conscious and well-balanced decision. Tung Lung Chau has very high conservation value and is considered most undesirable. Heung Yuen Wai and Lin Ma Hang are subject to various development constraints. By comparison, Kong Nga Po and Hei Ling Chau are two lesser evils among the site options. In future project feasibility study, all environmental issues have to be addressed and mitigated. 				