



Room 2006, 20th floor, Murray Building, Garden Road, Central, Hong Kong
Tel: 848 2551 Fax: 845 3489
香港中環花園道美利大廈20樓2006室 • 電話: 848 2551 傳真機: 845 3489

(ACE Paper 46/96)
for advice

Report of the EIA Subcommittee

The Subcommittee considered three Environmental Impact Assessment reports in September. One EIA report was considered by circulation and the other two EIA reports were discussed at the Subcommittee's meeting held on 9 September 1996.

Kennedy Town Traffic Management Measures Stage 3 - Widening of Kennedy Town Praya (*ACE-EIA Paper 18/96*)

2. This paper presented the key findings and the recommendations of the EIA study for the widening of the Kennedy Town Praya.
3. The project would form part of the strategic road network development in the Western District to meet the traffic requirements. In conjunction with the Belcher Bay Link and the Smithfield Road Extension, it provides a corridor to link up Connaught Road West, the Western harbour Crossing and Pokfulam Road.
4. Traffic noise was found to be the major concern for this project. However, due to prevailing site conditions, no direct noise mitigation measures can be provided to reduce the noise levels. The findings and recommendations of the EIA study to provide indirect mitigation measures in the form of window insulation and air-conditioning to the eligible affected dwellings were accepted by the Environmental Study Management Group. The HyD has agreed to implement all of the recommended mitigation measures
5. Subject to ExCo's approval, indirect mitigation measures in the form of window insulation and air-conditioning will be provided to about 1,786 eligible affected dwelling units along the road. Upon ExCo's approval, the eligibility of premises for the provision of indirect noise mitigation measures will be investigated in detail. Similar arrangements have been in place for other projects (e.g. Western Harbour Crossing).

6. Members considered the report by circulation. They were satisfied with the report and agreed to recommend endorsement of the EIA report without conditions.

**Proposed Reclamation and Relocation of United Floating Dock at Tsing Yi
(ACE-EIA Paper 16/96)**

7. The project is to relocate the floating dock 'United' that Hong Kong United Dockyards Ltd. (HUD) is operating off Yam O Wan, north of Lantau Island, to the company's shipyard on the west side of Tsing Yi Island. This will provide land access to the floating dock, bringing with it efficiency and commercial benefits to the company. On the environmental side, contaminants in washwaters are trapped by drainage port filters at the floating dock. Land based operation will allow for collection and further treatment of contaminated washwaters before discharge to the marine environment.

8. The EIA study has concluded that environmental impacts associated with the proposed project can be controlled within established standards and guidelines through the proper design of the works and the implementation of the recommended methods of works and treatment facilities. The findings and recommendations of the EIA study have been accepted by the Environmental Study Management Group which comprises EPD, Marine Dept., AFD, Planning Dept. and Lands Dept. HUD has agreed to implement all the recommendations of the EIA study. The main recommendations of the EIA study are :

- (a) dredging of marine mud to be carried out with closed grab dredgers and with the use of silt curtain;
- (b) provision of block work seawall before reclamation to retain fill dispersion;
- (c) careful control of underwater blasting; and
- (d) provision of a washwaters collection and filtration system to remove contaminants in paint flakes.

9. The Sub-committee was especially concerned with potential contamination caused by the TBT (Tributyl Tin) paint flakes and requested to see reports on TBT pollution in Hong Kong as well as any policy being developed by the Administration to deal with the problem. Nonetheless, most members were appreciative of the commitment by HUD to implement a washwater collection and filtration system. One member, however, was not satisfied with the 80% removal rate and would like to see a more

comprehensive system in place. That member was not prepared to endorse the report.

10. Notwithstanding the concerns of the member noted above, the Subcommittee agreed to recommend endorsement of the EIA report with this condition :

- (a) that there will be an EM & A programme to monitor the discharge and the efficiency of the washwater collection and filtration system.

**Site Formation of the Tin Shui Wai Reserve Zone Under Packages I and II
(ACE-EIA Paper 17/96)**

11. The Tin Shui Wai Reserve Zone is a piece of land already reclaimed in 1980's. Under a consultancy conducted by Planning Department in 1995, a Master Development Plan (MDP) was prepared setting out the overall landuse arrangement and the transport requirements. That study recommended that an Environmental Impact Assessment study should be carried out to address the impacts of developments in Tin Shui Wai Reserve Zone.

12. Subsequently, the Tin Shui Wai Reserve Zone was selected by the Task Force on Land Supply and Housing Sites as a solution space to meet housing needs. Its development is divided into a number of packages. The project covered by the EIA study report covers the site formation works only. This EIA study is the first stage of the EIA study for the entire Reserve Zone Development, and is prepared on a stand-alone basis to seek the endorsement of the site formation works only. Other packages of the development works will be subjected to a separate EIA submission to be put to the ACE EIA Sub-committee later.

13. This EIA study was endorsed by the members of the Environmental Study Management Group on the basis that it will not pre-empt the findings and recommendations of the on-going study for other development packages in the Reserve Zone. The Territory Development Department has agreed to implement all the recommendations in the EIA report.

14. However, some members were very concerned about splitting the site formation EIA from the EIA for the developments. Some were also not convinced with the findings of no ecological impacts in this EIA. Furthermore, some members were concerned that a recommendation to endorse the site formation EIA might give a false signal to the Housing Authority to embark on planning of the housing development which could turn out to be abortive if the full EIA for the development unveiled significant adverse impacts.

15. Because opinions were divided and no consensus could be formed, members agreed to refer the matter to the full Council for resolution and decision.

Advice Sought

16. Members are requested to consider the recommendation of the EIA Subcommittee:

- (a) endorsement of the Kennedy Town Traffic Management Measures Stage 3 - Widening of Kennedy Town Praya EIA report (para. 6 refers);
- (b) endorsement of the Proposed Reclamation and Relocation of United Floating Dock at Tsing Yi EIA report with condition (para. 10 refers);

17. Members are also requested to consider whether the Site Formation of the Tin Shui Wai Reserve Zone Under Packages I and II EIA report should be endorsed in light of the concerns of the EIA Sub-committee (para. 14 refers).

Planning, Environment & Lands Branch (Environment Division)
September 1996