



Room 924, 9th floor, Murray Building, Garden Road, Central, Hong Kong
Tel: 2848 2606 Fax: 2530 5264
香港中環花園道美利大廈9樓924室•電話：2848 2606 傳真機：2530 5264

(ACE Paper 7/98)
for advice

Report of the 34th and 35th EIA Subcommittee Meetings

This paper sets out the Subcommittee's views and recommendations on the EIA reports and the implementation arrangements and consultation procedures with ACE under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance considered at its meetings held on 19 January 1998 and 9 February 1998.

Fanling Sheung Shui Development Formation and Servicing, Area 36, Fanling Environmental Impact Assessment (ACE EIA Paper 1/98)

2 The project aims to provide 22 hectares of land and the associated roads and drainage services in Fanling Area 36 for the development of the public rental estate, Home Ownership Scheme, Sandwich Class Housing, village type houses, clinic and schools. The whole area will accommodate a population of 28,800. The EIA indicated that noise and dust impacts during construction stage could be mitigated to meet the established standards through the implementation of appropriate control measures. Major impacts highlighted were traffic noise and ecology.

3 It was identified that various sensitive future land uses in Area 36 would be affected by future traffic noise from the proposed Roads D1 and D2. Direct noise mitigation measures, including low noise surfacing, noise barriers and enclosures, were considered but were found to be impracticable because of many ingress and egress points along the roads. To redress the problem, planned residential developments would be set back by 10 m to 16 m and the angle-of-view would be limited to 100 degrees. For schools, noise sensitive teaching rooms will be put away from the roads. Noise insulation and air conditioners will be provided, where necessary.

4 On ecology, the major impacts were the loss of the Shek Sheung River and all associated riparian habitat within the site. To offset, the section of Shek Sheung River bisecting the site would be relocated to the southern side of the site. The new river channel would be grasscreted on the sloping faces with perforated concrete at the bottom. Trees of native species would be planted along the roads and channelside. The largest piece of fungshui woodland at the northern edge of the site would be preserved under the Green Belt zoning.

Subcommittee's views and recommendations

5 Members were, in general, content with the recommendations set out in the report. However, they would like to monitor the actual compliance of the recommendations. At the request of the Subcommittee, the project proponent would provide the EM&A Manual to Members for information. Members could ask for the EM&A reports for review if necessary.

6 The Subcommittee agreed to recommend the endorsement of the report without condition.

MTR Tseung Kwan O Extension (TKE) Phase II EIA Study (ACE EIA Paper 2/98)

7 The MTR Tseung Kwan O Extension (TKE) principally serves the new town of Tseung Kwan O to the east of Kowloon and provides improved public transport in the area. The TKE Phase I line consists of the main line running eastward from Lam Tin to Po Lam. The EIA of Phase I was endorsed by the full Council on 25 August 1997 on the condition that government policy on ecological compensation would be followed. The proposed Phase II works consists of a spur line which will leave the main line just east to Tseung Kwan O Station, run below ground in tunnel and emerge at ground level in the north-east corner of Area 86. A maintenance depot and a new station in Area 86 will be provided.

8 The EIA concluded that there was no insurmountable environmental problem arising from the proposed project. Practical mitigation measures have been recommended to maintain the dust impacts during construction within acceptable levels. Construction noise at most sensitive receivers could be controlled to within the established standards by using quiet plant and temporary noise barriers, and restricting operating time. Two proposed schools and one proposed clinic would require provision of noise insulation and air conditioning. An environmental management plan would be formulated by the contractor and regular monitoring and audit would be conducted by the project proponent to ensure compliance of the recommendations.

Subcommittee's views and recommendations

9 Members were satisfied with the recommendations of the report and agreed to recommend its endorsement without condition.

Environmental Impact Assessment Study for Demolition of Tsing Yi Power Station - Non-Blasting Option (ACE EIA Paper 4/98)

10 The China Light and Power Company Limited (CLP) is granted under lease 10.42 ha of industrial land in South Tsing Yi Island to operate an oil-fired power station which has now ceased production. In mid 1997, CLP proposed to retain about 1/3 of the site area for storage, workshop and office use and return the remaining area to Government. Before Government takes over the site, CLP is required to demolish all civil structures above ground and reinstate any potential contaminated land.

11 The EIA indicated that with the implementation of recommended mitigation measures, including the proper treatment of chemical wastes and the employment of an Registered Asbestos Consultant to conduct asbestos demolition works, environmental impacts could be alleviated. The main impact arising from the project was land contamination.

12 CLP had completed a desk-top study and a field assessment on land contamination within the site. Only one ground water sample collected within the site area to be retained by CLP showed exceedances of two aromatic hydrocarbon limits. An additional assessment would be undertaken by CLP to confirm the validity of the exceedance sample and recommend appropriate remedial plan. A detailed cleansing programme for potentially contaminated underground uses would also be prepared when civil structures are removed to allow access to subsurface structures.

Subcommittee's views and recommendations

13 The Subcommittee was satisfied with the recommendations of the report. However, concerns were raised on the disposal of demolition wastes. The project proponent undertook to reuse as much as practicable demolition wastes on-site and to minimize the use of road transport of wastes.

14 Members agreed to recommend endorsement of the report without condition.

Environmental Impact Assessment on HEC's Proposed New 1800 MW Power Station (ACE EIA Paper 5/98)

15 Hong Kong Electric Company Limited (HEC) proposed to construct a 1800 MW power station to meet Hong Kong's future power demand. The Executive Council, in November 1996, decided that HEC should proceed with a Site Search study and an EIA on a no commitment basis. Two fuel options, coal and pipeline natural gas, were kept open during the studies.

16 The EIA recommended that the overall environmentally preferred combination from the fuel, technology and site options was a gas-fired power station using the combined cycle gas turbine technology, forming an extension to the existing Lamma Power Station. Local environmental issues, such as the impacts on air quality, water quality and marine ecology, were likely to be surmountable with the implementation of proper mitigation measures. The contribution from the proposed power station to regional air pollution would also be small. However the additional emission of greenhouse gas from the coal-fired option was considered as significant.

17 HEC identified a liquefied natural gas (LNG) source in Shenzhen and proposed that LNG be used in the proposed new power station in view of the obvious environmental advantages. Nonetheless, if Government ultimately approves HEC's request to build the power station, a more detailed EIA would be required to address the issues highlighted in the current EIA.

Subcommittee's views and recommendations

18 Members were content with the findings of the report on fuel, technology and site options. However, concerns were raised on the need for a new power station and the associated greenhouse gas emission issue. The Subcommittee noted the concerns and agreed to recommend the fuel, technology and site options identified in the report to the full Council for endorsement without condition.

Supplementary EIA for River Trade Terminal (RTT) Proposed Sand Borrow - Brother's Marine Borrow Area (ACE EIA Paper 6/98)

19 The RTT is designed to maximise the capacity of the Hong Kong Harbour and discourage utilisation of the Ma Wan Channel by large numbers of small vessels thus reducing the risk of marine traffic accidents in the Ma Wan Fairway. The original EIA, which was endorsed by the full Council in October 1996, recommended that the sand for reclamation would be imported from the Mainland. The project proponent now considered the Brothers' Marine Borrow Area (MBA) an alternative reliable sand reserve for the RTT reclamation. A supplementary EIA was therefore conducted to identify possible environmental impacts.

20 The EIA concluded that there was no insurmountable environmental impacts. In order to maintain the suspended sediment levels within the Water Quality Objectives, a reduction in the number of dredging cycles of marine sand extraction from 12 per day to 8 was recommended during neap tide. On dolphin monitoring, the EM&A team would provide the workers with a basic fact sheet on the Chinese White Dolphin and brief the person responsible for monitoring on the correct procedures to be adopted upon sighting a dolphin. Auditing and independent checking would be conducted to ensure compliance.

Subcommittee's views and recommendations

21 Initially, some Members were concerned about the dredging volume and dolphin monitoring. Having considered the written responses from the project proponent, which was circulation to Members on 4 February 1998, Members were satisfied with the EIA findings and agreed to recommend endorsement of the supplementary EIA report without condition.

Environmental Impact Assessment on Route 16 from West Kowloon to Shatin (ACE EIA Paper 7/98)

22 The project aims to provide a new trunk road connecting West Kowloon at Lai Chi Kok and Shatin at Tai Wai. It is required to overcome anticipated traffic problems at the Lion Rock Tunnel, Tate's Cairn Tunnel and Tai Po Road. The EIA indicated that with the implementation of the recommended mitigation measures, environmental impacts during construction stage could be kept within acceptable levels. Major impacts highlighted were traffic noise and ecology.

23 It was predicted that traffic noise levels at some residential developments would exceed the established standards. A series of direct mitigation measures, such as roadside noise barriers, earth embankment and low noise road surfaces, were recommended to redress the problem. Noise insulation to eligible dwellings was recommended to alleviate the residual impacts.

24 The EIA anticipated that the landtaking for the construction of the Toll Plaza and Ventilation Building without any mitigation would result in a loss of about 5 ha of secondary woodland. It was recommended to implement landtake minimising design, such as undergrounding or decking over of some facilities and reducing the number of toll lanes, which would reduce some 0.5 ha landtake. Woodland planting using local species would be provided on-site to mitigate the residual impacts.

Subcommittee's views and recommendations

25 Members were, in general, content with the recommendations of the report. Concerns were raised on the loss of woodland. The project proponent agreed to pay special attention to the design and construction of the project so that there would be no net loss of woodland. The Subcommittee agreed to recommend endorsement of the report subject to the following conditions:

- (a) there would be no net loss of woodland; and
- (b) the amount and location of replanting to be done would be provided.

Implementation of Environmental Impact Assessment (ACE EIA Paper 8/98)

26 The Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Ordinance was enacted on 4 February 1997. Other statutory instrument, including the Environmental Impact Assessment (Appeal Board) Regulation, the Environmental Impact Assessment (Fees) Regulation and the Technical Memorandum on EIA Process, were also in place. The Administration therefore decided to commence the EIA Ordinance and its subsidiary legislation on 1 April 1998.

Subcommittee's views and recommendations

27 The Subcommittee considered and agreed with the implementation arrangements and the consultation procedures to be adopted. Members noted that project profiles would be placed on the EPD Internet's EIA Ordinance Homepage. Instead of receiving project profiles by facsimile, Members preferred to be provided with a fax notification only so that they could either download the document from the Homepage or request for a hard copy.

28 Members' comments were incorporated in the revised paper (ACE Paper 8/98) which will be presented to the full Council on 24 February 1998.

Advice Sought

29 Members are invited to consider the recommendations of the Subcommittee on the following:-

- (a) endorsement of the Fanling Sheung Shui Development Formation and Servicing, Area 36 Fanling Environmental Impact Assessment without condition;
- (b) endorsement of the MTR Tseung Kwan O Extension (TKE) Phase II Environmental Impact Assessment Study without condition;
- (c) endorsement of the Environmental Impact Assessment Study for Demolition of Tsing Yi Power Station - Non-Blasting Option without conditions;
- (d) endorsement of the Environmental Impact Assessment on HEC's Proposed New 1800 MW Power Station without conditions;
- (e) endorsement of the Supplementary Environmental Impact Assessment for River Trade Terminal (RTT) Proposed Sand Borrow - Brothers' Marine Borrow Area without condition; and

- (f) endorsement of the Environmental Impact Assessment on Route 16 from West Kowloon to Shatin subject to the conditions set out in para 24.

Planning, Environment and Lands Bureau
February 1998